

Review

by prof. Kristiyan Stoyanov Hadzhiev, PhD, NBU, Department of Administration and Management, professional field 3.7 Administration and Management, scientific major 05.02.20 Social Management

Regarding: dissertation thesis for obtaining the educational and scientific degree of **doctor** in the higher education field 3. Social, Economic, and Legal Studies in the professional field 3.7. Administration and Management, doctoral programme “Administration and Management outside the Field of Material Production” (Public administration)”.

Grounds for writing the review: member of the scientific jury for the defense of the dissertation thesis in accordance with Order No. 287/24 April 2024 of the Rector of the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov.

Author of the dissertation thesis: Gent Arbnor Begolii – doctoral student in doctoral programme “Organization and Management outside the Field of Material Production” (Public Administration)

Topic of the dissertation: *“Functional Analysis of the Work of Cultural Institutions in the Republic of Kosovo”*

Scientific adviser: assoc. prof. Hristo Sirashki, PhD

The review is prepared in accordance with the requirements of the Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria – ADASRB, the Regulations for the Implementation of the ADASRB and the Regulations for the Development of the Academic Staff at the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics, Svishtov.

1. General characteristic of the presented dissertation thesis

The reviewed dissertation consists of 173 pages and includes three chapters, an introduction, a conclusion, a bibliographical reference and 4 appendices. The main text consists of 144 pages and contains 14 tables and 15 figures. There are 17 pages of appendices related to the research in the dissertation, where the questionnaire used for the analysis of the functions of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo is presented, as well as additional tables with the results of the research. 107 literary sources are included to support the argument.

The presented dissertation is dedicated to an extremely **relevant and poorly researched issue** related to the role and functions of cultural institutions in the process of social and cultural transformation in an environment with a high degree of uncertainty. The different scope and depth of changes in technologies, consumer demands, shorter life cycle of offered goods and services, economic and political instability require organizations to constantly redesign and balance the elements of organizational design (processes, structure, systems) in order to realize strategic objectives, gain competitive advantage, and achieve sustainable organizational performance. **The subject** of the research is the specific functions of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo. **The main objective** of the research is to analyze the management and

specific functions of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo and, on this basis, to identify adequate development strategies in accordance with the expectations of the society. **The main research thesis** is that the functional analysis of cultural institutions is one of the tools for studying the conformity of the regulated functions of the cultural institutions of the Republic of Kosovo and their actual implementation.

The research methodology is fully synchronized with the main objective and the formulated research objectives. There is a clear decomposition of the methodological tools along the lines of the research objectives, which guarantees the achievement of the main research aim. An adapted set of tools has been developed for the purposes of the research (questionnaire for the analysis of the functions of cultural institutions).

I fully accept this approach to research methodology development. It is well grounded and logical. On the one hand, it clearly shows the connection and logical line of the dissertation thesis in terms of “aims-methods-results”, and on the other hand, it guarantees the precision of the research and the relevance of the obtained results.

In this context, the statements, ideas, and proposals contained in the dissertation have a practical and applied character.

The dissertation is **balanced**, the issues under consideration are presented in their logical sequence and connection, the presentation style is scientific, the technical layout is excellent.

The aim and objectives are linked and consistent and fully correspond to the topic of the dissertation thesis. The main scientific problem is correctly formulated, and its limitations are precisely defined. The research objectives, the object, the subject, and the main thesis of the research are clearly and specifically stated. A methodology has been developed that is completely sufficient to achieve the aims of the research. The concepts and terms used in the dissertation are specified.

The literature used is as close as possible to the topic of the dissertation and gives a sufficiently complete picture of the state of the researched problem. The literary sources are arranged according to the requirements of the accepted standards.

The doctoral student has analyzed and systematized a significant volume of literary sources on the subject, which are correctly cited in the text. An author's critical interpretation of the theses presented in them has been made.

The text is well illustrated with many tables and figures, which significantly contribute to its understanding. The results of the scientific research are presented clearly, logically, and comprehensibly.

From what has been said so far, I come to the conclusion that the ultimate expertise of the doctoral student on the above-mentioned questions is one of the prerequisites for the high quality of the entire dissertation thesis.

2. Assessment of the Scientific and Scientific and Applied Results

In accordance with the formulated aim and detailed objectives, the author has developed the structure of the dissertation thesis.

The introduction of the dissertation contains all the necessary “requisites”: a convincing justification of the problem and its significance; clear and precise formulations of the aim and research objectives; of the object and subject of the research; the research thesis; argumentation of the choice of research approaches and methods. The author has identified the conditions under which the research itself has been conducted.

In the first chapter, based on a critical theoretical analysis and literature review, the doctoral student clarifies the conceptual apparatus, the fundamental concepts and relationships related to the essence of cultural management and the importance of management functions in the process of development of cultural institutions. The specific models for the management of

culture, which also determine the policy in this public sphere, are analyzed. The author has identified three main policies (models of cultural action): ***cultural diffusionism***, which is based on creating conditions for cultural creativity, development of cooperation and formation of national cultural identity; ***cultural functionalism***, which is based on the active participation of the state in the development of the sphere of culture primarily through a system of incentives and cross-sectoral activities and the creation of conditions for a more democratic cultural life, by involving all social groups in the processes of cultural production and social activities from the cultural mosaic of a given society, with the aim of increasing the institutional efficiency of cultural institutions and organizations at the national level; The third model that the author has explored is ***cultural mercantilism***; it expresses the idea that the value of an art product is measured by market success. Based on the presented models, the main factors that destabilize the cultural environment are summarized and analyzed. Recommendations have been formulated for overcoming the cultural consequences of the crisis problems in the Republic of Kosovo.

In the first chapter of the dissertation, the basis of the author's research is laid on the topic of functional analysis of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo, paying particular attention to the management functions performed in the research object. Based on established postulates about the number, essence and scope of management functions, the author's position regarding the general management and specific functions of cultural institutions is presented.

From the ***first chapter***, the degree of development of the research problem becomes clear and the theoretical base is formed, on the basis of which the doctoral student derives the main research thesis. The conclusions reached by the doctoral student are reasonable, supported by solid arguments. The research in the first chapter is very thorough and provides the necessary basis for developing the methodology of the empirical research.

In the second chapter, the doctoral student presents and defends ***the author's methodology for functional analysis of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo***. In the construction of the methodology, the doctoral student refers to established approaches, which include a complex of tools, models, and techniques in relation to the specific aims and objectives. Through the prism of the dynamic theory of systems, the author has investigated the interaction between direct and reverse compensatory relationships and the synergistic, multiplicative, and integrative effects derived from it.

The essence, scope and types of functional analysis are systematized as a management tool for goal-adaptive management and generating important levels of efficiency. The basis of the methodology is the set of tools, through which the author can conduct analysis and evaluation of the performance of the functions in the organization in accordance with the management structure of the system. This coherence and coordination are the basis of the sustainability of the management process and the realization of organizational goals. On this basis, an adapted methodology for functional analysis of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo is proposed. The object of research is 17 main cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo, which have high public recognition, opportunities, and potential for development.

In the ***third chapter*** of the dissertation, based on empirical research, the doctoral student approves the proposed adapted methodology for conducting a functional analysis of cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo.

The need for a ***functional analysis*** of the studied 17 cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo is defended through a SWOT analysis, for which three representatives from each institution were interviewed using the Delphi method to generate independent subjective assessments. On this basis, the external opportunities, and threats, as well as the internal strengths and weaknesses of the researched cultural institutions, have been identified. The questionnaire, developed by the doctoral student, is conditionally divided into three parts, and

in the first, questions are asked about the external opportunities and threats, the internal strengths and weaknesses of the institutions, and suggestions for improvements. In the second part, there are questions related to the performance of the management functions of cultural institutions, and in the third – questions regarding their specific functions. The **conclusion** that needs to be drawn is that the tools used are adequate for the extraction of detailed data necessary to achieve the goal and the fulfillment of the objectives of the dissertation thesis.

In accordance with the formulated aims, a functional analysis of the management functions of the cultural institutions – object of the study – has been made. **4 general management and 11 specific functions** for cultural institutions have been analyzed and evaluated. Based on the results of the conducted research, the conclusions of the SWOT analysis and the functional analysis, the doctoral student has formulated a portfolio of 30 recommended strategies for the development (product, market, organizational and others) of the cultural institutions in the Republic of Kosovo. The choice of a specific strategy is based on the specific results of the functional analysis.

The processing of the information clearly shows the presence of the author's own contribution to the collection and analysis of the empirical data.

The conclusion that is reached is that the doctoral student shows not only skills for researching objects, problem situations, relevant formulations, justification, and systematization of classifications, but also clear highlighting and reasoned scientific defense of his own theses. The approach of comparison and contrast of objects and tools, abstraction (extraction of common features), concretization (the search for abstract patterns and images in new objects) is widely used. There are numerous generalizations, judgments, and formalizations. The methods of induction and deduction have been used to move from the specific to the general and back to the particular, multiple analogies and modeling to utilize the theoretical accumulations in the final result. The developed methodology for functional analysis identifies the steps (technological algorithm) adapted to cultural institutions. Data collection methods mainly include surveying. The immediate results of the research are interpreted on the basis of detailed qualitative argumentation and justification through the prism of public administration.

In the conclusion, the author analyzes and offers adequate solutions to the investigated problems, systematizing and summarizing the recommendations for social and organizational practice. The limitations of the research and the main contributions are presented. Directions for future research are outlined.

Dissertation research result: confirmation of the formulated main research thesis.

3. Description of the scientific and scientific and applied contributions

The dissertation contains a number of statements, ideas and proposals that can be evaluated as contributions of a scientific and applied nature in the context of the analysis and synthesis of the existing scientific knowledge in the field, regarding the Enrichment of existing scientific knowledge criterion. I fully accept the doctoral student's claims to the **four contributions** cited. The list of contributions is correctly compiled and objectively reflects the scientific results achieved by the doctoral student. The contribution elements in the dissertation show that the doctoral student has in-depth knowledge in the researched scientific field and is capable of conducting independent scientific research and logically interpreting its results.

4. Impact of the dissertation thesis on the external environment

In support of his research and as an expression of publicity of his ideas, the doctoral student has presented a list of *six* publications – 1 article and 5 papers, one of which is *co-authored*. They are published in renowned specialized scientific publications, which testifies that the immediate results of the dissertation research are accessible to a professional audience. All of them reflect specific aspects of the doctoral student’s research and provide the necessary publicity.

It can be concluded that the publications are sufficient both quantitatively and qualitatively. In practice, they exceed the minimum national requirements.

5. Assessment of the abstract

The submitted abstract in Bulgarian has a volume of 45 pages, and in English – 41 pages. It correctly reflects the content of the dissertation thesis. It summarizes the main points of the dissertation: general characteristics; structure and content of the three chapters, the thesis, the object, and the methodology of the scientific research, as well as the achieved theoretical-methodological and empirical results; scientific contributions; publications on the issues of the dissertation, statement of originality and as such meets the requirements.

6. Critical notes, recommendations, and questions

I have no critical notes on the presentation of ideas, statements, and immediate results in the dissertation thesis. I recommend that the doctoral student publish it as a book. Moreover, it is particularly interesting from a scientific point of view to apply the adapted methodology for conducting functional analysis through focus groups of representatives of Bulgarian cultural institutions and to analyze the immediate results.

7. Conclusion

The presented dissertation shows that the author has in-depth knowledge of the issues that he is researching – he is familiar with and has analyzed the literature on the topic, he can formulate research problems, systematize classical and new theories and concepts, construct a research apparatus, conduct empirical research, and justify suggestions for the improvement of existing practice. The topic of the dissertation thesis is relevant and significant in a scientific and practical and applied aspect. The dissertation is a fully completed scientific and practical and applied study that meets the requirements of the Act on the Development of the Academic Staff, the Regulations for its Application, as well as the internal regulatory framework of the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov for awarding the educational and scientific degree of doctor. In his research, the doctoral student shows that he has the ability to conduct *independent scientific research and obtain specific scientific and scientific-applied results and contributions*.

All this gives me the ground to give a **positive assessment of the dissertation thesis** and to propose to the respected members of the scientific jury to make a decision to **award the educational and scientific degree of doctor** to Ghent Arbnor Begolii in the doctoral programme “Administration and Management outside the Field of Material Production” (Public administration)” **in the professional field 3.7 “Administration and Management”**.

Sofia,
17 May 2024

Signature:

/prof. Kristiyan Hadzhiev, PhD/